

Past Imperfect

Facts, Fictions, Fraud—
American History from
Bancroft and Parkman
to Ambrose, Bellesiles,
Ellis, and Goodwin

PETER CHARLES HOFFER



PUBLICAFFAIRS NEW YORK

BOOKNOTES
BRIAN P. LAMB
C-SPAN AIR DATE

Weekly Standard
Free Barnes
Mugh. Lewis
Forbes mag
Was it Political Spin
History news Network
What about
Sleepless Oates

4 cases you might
Court showdown over
Professional Division
of AHA as it
decided to end 15 years
of adjudication p139

Bernard Bailyn -
Greatest living historian
Richard Hofstadter
Oscar Handlin
Bery Miller
10 - consensus history

796. Peter Charles Hoffer

Past Imperfect: Facts, Fictions, Fraud American History from Banc
and Parkman to Ambrose, Bellesiles, Ellis and Goodwin

Taped: 10/18/04

Aired: 11/21/04

Tape #: 183682

National Constitution Center

National History Standards - 92-96
Impeachment of Bill Clinton
Enrole Bay exhibit

My wife
Natalie Hull
grad. ed. Col. 74'
1965- 10% of all
PhD's in
History
2002- 38%

What does a plagiarist look like 176

primary vs. secondary sources

"close paraphrase" - Ambrose did not regard it as plagiarism

Ambrose p 185 - borrow illicitly
haste of his final years

overcaution of poorly trained research assistants

Goodwin -

1998 Lynda McTaggart Kathleen Kennedy Her Life and Time

Legal issues vs. ethical ones

Settlement - over 173 instances etc.

on re-write B. refused to use quote marks - would
flow of narrative.

I'm convinced she did plagiarize p203

142 Bellesiles - no doubt he misrepresented the findings

1996 - summer I sat on National Endowment Panel of Research
Programs - all were supporters of new history

I gave B. highest rating

New historians are often partisans in their classrooms
and opinion pieces

B - good man but assumed ends justify the means
published Army America - late summer 2000

Bancroft Prize

Francis Parkman Prize

Allan Nevins - a conservative - 19 books
Henry Steele Commager - a liberal - 16
Charles Beard - progressive
Daniel Boorstin
Woodrow Wilson - commitment to prejudices of the time

Past Imperfect

What is the professional division
of the American Historical Association

Popular history
vs.
Academic history

BOOKNOTES
2004-11-21

For Natalie, A Get Well Gift.

Copyright © 2004 by Peter Charles Hoffer.

Published in the United States by PublicAffairs™, a member of the Perseus Books Group.

All rights reserved.

Printed in the United States of America.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles and reviews. For information, address PublicAffairs, 250 West 57th Street, Suite 1321, New York, NY 10107. PublicAffairs books are available at special discounts for bulk purchases in the U.S. by corporations, institutions, and other organizations. For more information, please contact the Special Markets Department at the Perseus Books Group, 11 Cambridge Center, Cambridge, MA 02142, call (617) 252-5298, or e-mail special.markets@perseusbooks.com.

BOOK DESIGN AND COMPOSITION BY JENNY DOSSIN. TEXT SET IN ITC NEW BASKERVILLE.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Hoffer, Peter Charles, 1944-

Past imperfect : facts, fictions, fraud—American history from Bancroft and Parkman to Ambrose, Bellesiles, Ellis, and Goodwin / Peter Charles Hoffer.—1st ed.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 1-58648-244-0

1. United States—Historiography. 2. United States—History—Philosophy. 3. Historiography—Social aspects—United States—History—20th century. 4. Historiography—Political aspects—United States—History—20th century. 5. Historians—United States—Biography. 6. Bellesiles, Michael A. 7. Goodwin, Doris Kearns. 8. Ambrose, Stephen E. 9. Ellis, Joseph J. 10. Professional ethics—United States—Case studies. I. Title.

E175.H54 2004

973'.072—dc22

2004048653

FIRST EDITION

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Consensus History
Neo-Consensus
End of Consensus
New History
Popular History

National History
Standards
Enola Gay
Impeachment of
Clinton
Steven Coates

CONTENTS

✓ PREFACE		vii
✓ ACKNOWLEDGMENTS		xiii
✓ INTRODUCTION	Two-Faced History	1
✓ Part I: Facts and Fictions		11
<hr/>		
✓ CHAPTER ONE	The Rise of <u>Consensus History</u>	17
✓ CHAPTER TWO	Professions of History	32
✓ CHAPTER THREE	The <u>New History</u> and Its Promoters	62
✓ CHAPTER FOUR	In the Eye of the Storm	93
✓ Part II: Fraud		131
<hr/>		
✓ CHAPTER FIVE	Falsification: The Case of <u>Michael Bellesiles</u>	141
✓ CHAPTER SIX	Plagiarism: The Cases of <u>Stephen Ambrose</u> and <u>Doris Kearns Goodwin</u>	172
✓ CHAPTER SEVEN	Fabrication: The <u>Case of</u> Joseph Ellis	208
✓ CONCLUSION	The Future of the Past	231
NOTES		241
INDEX		273

19th Century historian - amateurs - didn't make money teaching or writing - Who were they?

White, Protestant, male

20th Century - academician - changed course on history series of comforting falsehoods - certain people were more equal

1960's Jews women blacks ethnic minorities

New History - criticized by an army of conservatives
~~the~~ educators, pundits and politicians